

WISCONSIN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PROPOSED REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE

SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON EXPUNCTION OF CRIMINAL RECORDS

May 29, 2007

PRL 2007-14

Special Committee on Expunction of Criminal Records

Prepared by: William Ford, Senior Staff Attorney, and Don Dyke, Chief of Legal Services May 29, 2007

CONTENTS

PART I - NO RECOMMENDATION	
PART II - COMMITTEE ACTIVITY	
Assignment	
Summary of Meetings	
Appendix 1 - Memorandum from Chairperson Robin Vos to Committee Regarding the Status of the Committee	: Members 7
Appendix 2 - Lists of Joint Legislative Council Members	9
Appendix 3 - List of Committee Members	11
Appendix 4 - Committee Materials List	13

PART I

NO RECOMMENDATION

The Special Committee on Expunction of Criminal Records has permanently adjourned. The Special Committee makes no recommendation.

The Special Committee held three meetings during which it focused on a draft creating a conditional discharge procedure under which a person could, by complying with certain court-ordered requirements, avoid a criminal conviction for most misdemeanors. Because the members of the Special Committee could not reach a consensus regarding the draft legislation, the chairperson permanently adjourned the Special Committee. **Appendix 1** is a memorandum from Chairperson Robin Vos, to committee members, explaining his decision to adjourn the committee.

PART II

COMMITTEE ACTIVITY

Assignment

The Joint Legislative Council established the Special Committee on Expunction of Criminal Records and appointed the chairperson by a June 9, 2006 mail ballot. The committee was directed to: study the circumstances under which records related to civil forfeiture and criminal proceedings may be expunged by Wisconsin courts and other record custodians. The circumstances to be considered include whether a record subject is a first offender, the age of the record subject, the time that has elapsed since the proceeding was commenced or the record subject was convicted, and the nature or seriousness of the crime or violation.

Membership of the Special Committee, appointed by an August 1, 2006 mail ballot, consisted of two Senators, two Representatives, and 10 public members. A list of committee members is included as *Appendix 3* to this report.

Summary of Meetings

The Special Committee held three meetings at the State Capitol in Madison on the following dates:

September 28, 2006 November 21, 2006 December 19, 2006

At the <u>September 28, 2006</u> meeting, the Special Committee heard testimony from the following invited speakers:

A. John Voelker, Director of State Courts, told the Special Committee why, based upon recommendations of the Wisconsin Circuit Court Access Oversight Committee, he asked that the Legislative Council conduct a study of current state law relating to expunction of criminal records. He also discussed the history and rationale of a number of policy decisions made with respect to the Wisconsin Circuit Court Access (WCCA) program.

Jean Bousquet, Chief Information Officer, Consolidated Court Automation Programs (CCAP), described the mechanics and growing popularity of the WCCA as a tool for free public access to criminal and civil records of adults. She also discussed recent changes made in the WCCA.

Mike Roberts, Administrator, Division of Law Enforcement Services, Wisconsin Department of Justice, described the computerized database maintained by the Crime Information Bureau (CIB) at the Wisconsin Department of Justice. He described the use of this database as a means for law enforcement personnel and the public to obtain criminal histories. In addition, he explained the process under which information may be removed from the CIB and how the circumstances for doing this differ from those under which records may be expunged from CCAP.

Gerald Mowris, State Bar of Wisconsin, Criminal Law Section, told the committee how the easy availability of criminal background information through WCCA and the CIB affects the employment and housing opportunities of persons who have been arrested or convicted. He described a number of possible revisions to current law relating to expunction of criminal records.

Sheila Sullivan, Attorney at Law, Legal Action of Wisconsin, Inc., described the Legal Intervention For Employment, or LIFE, Project that helps people who have had brushes with the law obtain and keep jobs. She also discussed a number of statistics relating to crime, arrests, and imprisonment. In addition, she described a number of specific instances relating to individuals affected by public access to information relating to their prior criminal history.

At the <u>November 21, 2006</u> meeting, the Special Committee discussed a proposal by committee member Judge Gary Carlson. Judge Carlson's proposal was to create a new statute relating to conditional discharge, under which persons convicted of certain offenses may, by satisfying conditions specified by the court, avoid a criminal conviction. In addition, the proposal included "sunsetting" certain information available to the public relating to criminal proceedings against individuals.

The Special Committee developed a preliminary proposal for draft legislation relating to conditional discharge that was to be further discussed at the next meeting held by the committee, which was on December 19, 2006.

At the <u>December 19, 2006</u> meeting, the Special Committee discussed WLC: 0015/1, draft legislation that would create a procedure under which, with respect to misdemeanors and under certain conditions, a defendant could avoid a criminal conviction by complying with conditions ordered by a court. The committee discussed possible revisions to the draft, including whether a guilty plea should be required as a condition of conditional discharge. Also discussed was whether conditional discharge should not be available for certain types of misdemeanors and, if so, what misdemeanors should be excluded.



WISCONSIN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

Terry C. Anderson, Director Laura D. Rose, Deputy Director

TO:

MEMBERS OF THE SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON EXPUNCTION OF CRIMINAL

RECORDS

FROM:

Representative Robin Vos, Chair

RE:

Special Committee Status

DATE:

May 10, 2007

This memorandum is to follow-up on the status of the Special Committee on Expunction of Criminal Records. Efforts have been made to achieve consensus on the issues the committee is considering. However, no common ground between parties can be found. Thus, I have decided not to reconvene the committee for any additional meetings.

While I know some committee members will be disappointed with the decision not to continue, the issues considered by the committee will be before the Legislature during this and future sessions. In fact, I have intentions of introducing some of the ideas from the committee as separate legislation this fall. The issues are numerous, complex, and fundamental and present difficult public policy choices. To adequately deal with these issues, it may ultimately be necessary to consider them in a context much broader than civil and criminal court records.

I want to thank committee members for their time and participation. The committee gathered valuable background information and identified many of the issues that arise from the maintenance and availability of criminal and civil court records. Consequently, the committee has performed a valuable service and laid important groundwork for future consideration of the issues.

Also, please find enclosed the minutes for the Special Committee's December 19, 2006 meeting. Committee members are requested to send any corrections regarding these minutes to the Legislative Council staff. After the incorporation of any corrections, these minutes will be considered approved by the committee.

Thank you.

RV:jal Enclosure

Appendix 2

Joint Legislative Council

[Joint Legislative Council Members Who Selected and Appointed Committee and Its Membership]

Co-Chair **ALAN LASEE**

Senate President 2259 Lasee Road De Pere, WI 54115 Co-Chair

STEVE WIECKERT

Representative 1 Weatherstone Drive Appleton, WI 54914

SENATORS

RONALD W. BROWN

1112 Violet Avenue Eau Claire, WI 54701

DAN KAPANKE 1610 Lakeshore Drive La Crosse, WI 54603

DALE SCHULTZ

Majority Leader 515 N. Central Avenue Richland Center, WI 53581

RUSSELL DECKER

6803 Lora Lee Lane Schofield, WI 54476 MARK MILLER

4903 Roigan Terrace Monona, WI 53716

DAVID ZIEN

President Pro Tempore 1716 63rd Street Eau Claire, WI 54703

SCOTT FITZGERALD

N4692 Maple Road Juneau, WI 53039

FRED A. RISSER

5008 Risser Road Madison, WI 53705

GLENN GROTHMAN

111 South 6th Avenue West Bend, WI 53095 JUDY ROBSON

Minority Leader 2411 E. Ridge Road Beloit, WI 53511

REPRESENTATIVES

JOHN AINSWORTH

W6382 Waukechon Road Shawano, WI 54166

MICHAEL HUEBSCH

Majority Leader 419 West Franklin West Salem, WI 54669

PEDRO COLON

338 West Walker Street Milwaukee, WI 53204

DEAN KAUFERT

1360 Alpine Lane Neenah, WI 54956

STEPHEN J. FREESE

Speaker Pro Tempore 310 East North Street Dodgeville, WI 53533 JIM KREUSER

Minority Leader 3505 14th Place Kenosha, WI 53144

JOHN GARD

Speaker 481 Aubin Street, P.O. Box 119 Peshtigo, WI 54157

ANN NISCHKE

202 W. College Avenue Waukesha, WI 53186

MARLIN D. SCHNEIDER

3820 Southbrook Lane Wisconsin Rapids, WI 54494

DAVID TRAVIS

5440 Willow Road Waunakee, WI 53597

This 22-member committee consists of the majority and minority party leadership of both houses of the Legislature, the co-chairs and ranking minority members of the Joint Committee on Finance, and 5 Senators and 5 Representatives appointed as are members of standing committees.

Joint Legislative Council

[Current Joint Legislative Council Members Receiving Committee Report]

<u>Co-Chair</u>	Co-Chair
EDED DIGGED	eo enun

FRED RISSER

Senate President

5008 Risser Road

Madison, WI 53705

Madison, WI 53705

STEVE WIECKERT

Representative

1 Weatherstone Drive
Appleton, WI 54914

SENATORS

ROGER BRESKE RUSSELL DECKER **ALAN LASEE** 8800 Hwy. 29 6803 Lora Lee Lane 2259 Lasee Road Eland, WI 54427 De Pere, WI 54115 Weston, WI 54476 TIM CARPENTER SCOTT FITZGERALD MARK MILLER President Pro Tempore Minority Leader 4903 Roigan Terrace 2957 South 38th Street Monona, WI 53716 N4692 Maple Road

Milwaukee, WI 53215

G. SPENCER COGGS

3732 North 40th Street

Milwaukee, WI 53216

SHEILA HARSDORF

N6627 County Road E

Milwaukee, WI 53216

River Falls, WI 54022

JUDY ROBSON

Majority Leader

2411 E. Ridge Road

River Falls, W1 54022 2411 E. Ridge Ro Beloit, WI 53511 ALBERTA DARLING

River Hills, WI 53217

1325 West Dean Road

Speaker Pro Tempore 1205 Noridge Trail

JOAN BALLWEGMICHAEL HUEBSCHMARK POCAN170 W. Summit StreetSpeaker309 N. Baldwin StreetMarkesan, WI 53946419 West FranklinMadison, WI 53703

REPRESENTATIVES

West Salem, WI 54669

TERESE BERCEAU

4326 Somerset Lane

Madison, WI 53711

West Salem, WI 54669

KITTY RHOADES

708 4th Street

Hudson, WI 54016

JEFF FITZGERALDJIM KREUSERMARLIN SCHNEIDERMajority LeaderMinority Leader3820 Southbrook Lane910 Sunset3505 14th PlaceWisconsin Rapids, WI 54494

Horicon, WI 53032 Kenosha, WI 53144

MARK GOTTLIEB

Port Washington, WI 53074

This 22-member committee consists of the majority and minority party leadership of both houses of the Legislature, the cochairs and ranking minority members of the Joint Committee on Finance, and 5 Senators and 5 Representatives appointed as are members of standing committees.

Appendix 3

Expunction of Criminal Records

Representative Robin Vos, Chair 4710 Eastwood Ridge Racine, WI 53406

Senator Alan Lasee 2259 Lasee Road De Pere, WI 54115

Judge Gary Carlson Taylor County 224 South Second Street Medford, WI 54451

Richard Dufour, District Attorney Marquette County 77 Park Street, P.O. Box 396 Montello, WI 54939

Michelle Litjens Land Pride Properties 426 Broad Street Oshkosh, WI 54901

Lyn Opelt, Assistant District Attorney Dane County District Attorney's Office 215 South Hamilton, Room 3000 Madison, WI 53703

Professor Dennis Rome UW-Parkside Department of Criminal Justice 900 Wood Road, P.O. Box 2000 Kenosha, WI 53141 Representative Tamara D. Grigsby 2354 N. 41st Street Milwaukee, WI 53210

Senator Fred A. Risser 100 Wisconsin Avenue, Unit 501 Madison, WI 53703

Tim Costello, Attorney Krukowski & Costello 7111 West Edgerton Avenue Milwaukee, WI 53220

Judge Bill Dyke Iowa County 222 North Iowa Street Dodgeville, WI 53533

Bill Lueders Wisconsin Freedom of Information Council 101 King Street Madison, WI 53703

Sheila Reiff, Clerk of Circuit Court Walworth County 1800 County Trunk NN Elkhorn, WI 53121

Kelli Thompson Deputy State Public Defender P.O. Box 7923 Madison, WI 53707

STUDY ASSIGNMENT: The committee is directed to study the circumstances under which records related to civil forfeiture and criminal proceedings may be expunged by Wisconsin courts and other record custodians. The circumstances to be considered include whether a record subject is a first offender, the age of the record subject, the time that has elapsed since the proceeding was commenced or the record subject was convicted, and the nature or seriousness of the crime or violation.

14 MEMBERS: 2 Senators, 2 Representatives, and 10 Public Members.

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL STAFF: Don Dyke, Chief of Legal Services; William Ford, Senior Staff Attorney; and Julie Learned, Support Staff.

Appendix 4

Committee Materials List

(Copies of documents are available at www.legis.state.wi.us/lc)

(Ospide et accamiente al c	, aranabio a			,				
December 19, 2006 Meeting	<u>Notice</u>	<u>Agenda</u>	<u>Audio</u>	<u>Minutes</u>				
<u>WLC: 0015/1</u> , a draft creating a conditional discharge procedure applicable to most misdemeanors and making the current expunction statute inapplicable to future violations								
 Memorandum, Proposed Legislation for December 19, 2006 Meeting, to the Special Committee from Bob Anderson and Sheila Sullivan, Legal Action of Wisconsin, Inc. (December 4, 2006) 								
November 21, 2006 Meeting	<u>Notice</u>	<u>Agenda</u>	<u>Audio</u>	<u>Minutes</u>				
• Memo No. 3, Initial Issues for Committee Consideration (November 9, 2006)								
• Memorandum, Survey of State Expungement Statutes, with two enclosed tables, from Lynn Deavers, Aaron Eidelman and Eric Gibson of the law firm of Dow, Lohnes and Albertson (August 3, 2005)								
o <u>Enclosure 1</u> o <u>Enclosure 2</u>								
	 <u>Letter</u>, Regarding Proposed Legislation for the Benefit of Wisconsin's Exonerees, with enclosures, from Attorney Mary C. Delaney (September 26, 2006) 							
Letter, with enclosures, from Attorney F	• <u>Letter</u> , with enclosures, from Attorney Raymond M. Dall'Osto (October 4, 2006)							
o Enclosure 1 o Enclosure 2 o Enclosure 3								
Memo, Special Committee on Expunction Legal Action of Wisconsin, Inc	 <u>Memo</u>, Special Committee on Expunction of Criminal Records: Comment and Recommendations, Legal Action of Wisconsin, Inc 							
<u>Cover letter</u> , enclosing <u>letter</u> to Represe Carlson	entative Vos, fro	om Special Comn	nittee membe	r Judge Gary				
September 28, 2006 Meeting	<u>Notice</u>	<u>Agenda</u>	<u>Audio</u>	<u>Minutes</u>				
 Memo No. 1, Laws on Expunction and Removal of Records Relating to Criminal Proceedings (September 19, 2006) 								

- (September 19, 2006)
- Memo No. 2, Selected Initial Background Information (September 19, 2006)
 - Final Report, Wisconsin Circuit Court Access Oversight Committee, March 2006
 - Information, regarding the Consolidated Court Automation Programs (CCAP), from the Wisconsin Court System website
 - Frequently Asked Questions, Wisconsin Circuit Court Access (WCCA), from the Wisconsin Court System website
 - Chapter SCR 72, Retention and Maintenance of Court Records
 - Information, regarding the Crime Information Bureau's criminal history database, from the State Department of Justice's website
- WCCA Action Plan, from A. John Voelker, Director of State Courts
- Fingerprint Record Removal Request, and Statutes of Interest, submitted by Mike Roberts, Administrator, Division of Law Enforcement Services, Wisconsin Department of Justice