

STATE OF WISCONSIN

Letter Report

Follow-Up on Overtime in State Agencies

April 2009



Legislative Audit Bureau

22 E. Mifflin St., Ste. 500, Madison, Wisconsin 53703-4225 • (608) 266-2818
Fax: (608) 267-0410 • Web site: www.legis.wisconsin.gov/lab



STATE OF WISCONSIN

Legislative Audit Bureau

22 East Mifflin Street, Suite 500
Madison, Wisconsin 53703
(608) 266-2818
Fax (608) 267-0410
www.legis.wisconsin.gov/lab

April 17, 2009

Janice Mueller
State Auditor

Senator Kathleen Vinehout and
Representative Peter Barca, Co-chairpersons
Joint Legislative Audit Committee
State Capitol
Madison, Wisconsin 53702

Dear Senator Vinehout and Representative Barca:

The attached report updates the analysis of overtime in state agencies that we first provided in a letter report issued in June 2008. Both documents focus on premium overtime, which is paid at 1.5 times the employee's regular hourly rate, typically for work in excess of 40 hours per week.

From 2005 through 2008, state agencies paid a total of \$253.8 million in overtime, of which \$209.8 million was premium overtime. Premium overtime payments increased 15.8 percent over that four-year period, and 0.9 percent from 2007 to 2008. Payments at regular hourly rates to employees who worked more than 40 hours per week increased \$0.8 million, or 11.6 percent, from 2007 to 2008.

Our previous analysis found that 90.0 percent of premium overtime payments were made by four state agencies that either have 24-hour operations or respond to emergencies: the Department of Corrections (DOC), the Department of Health Services (DHS, formerly the Department of Health and Family Services), the Department of Transportation, and the Department of Natural Resources. DOC's premium overtime payments declined \$1.3 million, or 3.7 percent, from 2007 to 2008, but the other three agencies' premium overtime payments increased. Our June 2008 report recommended that DOC and DHS analyze overtime use at their facilities and submit options for reducing overtime costs to the Joint Legislative Audit Committee by January 5, 2009. Both agencies recently requested additional time to submit their reports.

We also reviewed 2008 overtime payments to the ten employees with the highest premium overtime earnings from 2005 through 2007. Although payments to six of these individuals declined, their 2008 premium overtime earnings ranged from \$25,666 to \$85,818. We identified 25 DOC and DHS employees who each earned more than \$50,000 in premium overtime in addition to regular wages for 2008.

We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by staff of the Office of State Employment Relations, DOC, and DHS.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Janice Mueller".

Janice Mueller
State Auditor

JM/DA/ss

Enclosure

FOLLOW-UP ON OVERTIME IN STATE AGENCIES

State agencies paid a total of \$66.5 million in overtime during 2008, which is an increase of 2.2 percent over the prior year. However, we note that the calendar year was such that an additional biweekly pay period occurred in 2008, as it does approximately once every ten years.

The most common category of overtime is premium overtime, which is generally paid at 1.5 times the employee's regular hourly rate. The State also pays regular overtime, largely to supervisory or professional staff at the discretion of management, and holiday and other overtime. Regular overtime is paid at the employee's regular rate of pay for hours in excess of 40 per week. Holiday and other overtime is paid for regular hours that qualify for a higher rate of pay.

We obtained 2008 overtime data from the State's central payroll system. It excludes employees of the University of Wisconsin System, the Legislature, and the courts, who are paid through other systems or follow other personnel policies.

Table 1—Overtime Payments by Category

In 2008, state agencies paid a total of \$66.5 million for all overtime, including \$54.3 million for premium overtime. The appendix summarizes all premium overtime payments from 2005 through 2008 by state agency.

Regular overtime payments to employees who worked more than 40 hours per week increased \$0.8 million, or 11.6 percent, from 2007 to 2008.

Table 2—Four Departments with Highest Premium Overtime Payments

While most agencies have some employees who earn premium overtime, four agencies that either have 24-hour operations or must respond to emergencies continue to account for the majority of premium overtime payments:

- the Department of Corrections (DOC);
- the Department of Health Services (DHS, which was the Department of Health and Family Services at the time of our last report);
- the Department of Transportation (DOT); and
- the Department of Natural Resources (DNR).

Only DOC's premium overtime payments declined in 2008.

Table 3—Position Classifications Receiving the Highest Premium Overtime Payments

The same ten position classifications received the largest premium overtime payments during the last four years, and approximately 4,000 correctional officers and correctional sergeants accounted for 48.1 percent of all 2008 premium overtime payments. Premium overtime payments declined slightly for three DOC position classifications but increased for DOC youth counselors, as well as for certain DHS staff and state troopers.

Table 4—Employees with Highest Premium Overtime Earnings from 2005 through 2007

The table updates our June 2008 data for the ten employees with the highest premium overtime earnings from 2005 through 2007. Premium overtime payments to six of these individuals declined in 2008. The most significant decline was for the employee who earned the most premium overtime from 2005 through 2007 and retired in 2008.

We identified 25 employees—15 DOC correctional officers and correctional sergeants and 10 DHS direct patient care staff—who each earned more than \$50,000 in premium overtime in addition to their regular wages for 2008. Seven of the ten employees with the highest premium overtime earnings from 2005 through 2007 are included in that group. The most premium overtime paid in 2008 was \$97,800, which was paid to a nurse clinician at Mendota Mental Health Institute who averaged nearly 80 hours of overtime for each two-week pay period. This employee, who began employment in 2007, was not listed in Table 4 of our prior report.

Table 5—DOC’s Premium Overtime Payments by Position Classification

The table presents trend data for DOC employees. Premium overtime payments declined for four classifications and increased for one.

Table 6—Premium Overtime Payments to Direct Patient Care Staff

The table presents trend data for patient care staff of the three state agencies that operate health facilities or nursing homes. Premium overtime payments to DOC’s patient care staff declined in 2008, while premium overtime payments to DHS and Department of Veterans Affairs staff increased.

Table 1
Overtime Payments by Category
(in millions)

| Category ¹ | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | Total |
|----------------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|----------------|
| Premium Overtime | \$46.9 | \$54.8 | \$53.8 | \$54.3 | \$209.8 |
| Regular Overtime | 6.0 | 6.9 | 6.9 | 7.7 | 27.5 |
| Holiday and Other Overtime | 3.6 | 4.0 | 4.4 | 4.5 | 16.5 |
| Total | \$56.5 | \$65.7 | \$65.1 | \$66.5 | \$253.8 |

¹ The categories are defined as follows:

Premium Overtime—Hours in excess of 40 per work week that qualify for payment at a rate generally 1.5 times the employee's regular hourly rate.

Regular Overtime—Hours in excess of 40 per work week that are paid at the employee's regular hourly rate.

Holiday and Other Overtime—Regular hours that qualify for a higher rate of pay. For example, hours worked on a holiday generally are paid at 1.5 times the employee's regular hourly rate.

Table 2
Four Departments with Highest Premium Overtime Payments
(in millions)

| Department | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | Total |
|------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|---------|
| DOC | \$30.3 | \$36.1 | \$34.7 | \$33.4 | \$134.5 |
| DHS | 7.5 | 9.1 | 9.5 | 10.3 | 36.4 |
| DOT | 3.5 | 3.5 | 3.4 | 3.6 | 14.0 |
| DNR | 1.6 | 1.8 | 1.9 | 2.1 | 7.4 |

Table 3
Position Classifications Receiving the Highest Premium Overtime Payments
(in millions)

| Job Classification | Department(s) | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | Change from 2007 to 2008 |
|---|--|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|--------------------------|
| Correctional Officer | DOC, DHS | \$13.9 | \$16.2 | \$15.1 | \$14.5 | (4.0)% |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC, DHS | 10.6 | 12.8 | 12.2 | 11.6 | (4.9) |
| Resident Care Technician 2 | DHS | 2.9 | 3.2 | 3.3 | 3.4 | 3.0 |
| Probation and Parole Agent C | DOC | 2.2 | 2.9 | 3.1 | 2.9 | (6.5) |
| Nurse Clinician 2 | DOC, DHS, Public Instruction, Military Affairs, and Veterans Affairs | 2.0 | 2.3 | 2.5 | 2.5 | 0.0 |
| State Patrol Trooper | DOT | 1.1 | 1.4 | 1.7 | 1.9 | 11.8 |
| Youth Counselor | DOC | 1.3 | 1.4 | 1.2 | 1.5 | 25.0 |
| Resident Care Technician 1 | DHS | 0.7 | 1.1 | 1.4 | 1.6 | 14.3 |
| Psychiatric Care Technician | DHS | 0.6 | 1.1 | 1.3 | 1.5 | 15.4 |
| Conservation Warden | DNR | 0.8 | 0.9 | 0.9 | 0.9 | 0.0 |
| Premium Overtime for These Classifications | | \$36.1 | \$43.3 | \$42.7 | \$42.3 | (0.9) |

Table 4
Employees with Highest Premium Overtime Earnings from 2005 through 2007

| Position Classification | Agency | Facility | Age in 2007 | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 Update |
|----------------------------|--------|-------------------------------------|-------------|----------|----------|-----------|-----------------|
| Nurse Clinician 2—Weekend | DOC | Milwaukee Secure Detention Facility | 61 | \$72,749 | \$86,557 | \$103,412 | \$41,734 |
| Nurse Clinician 3 | DHS | Central Wisconsin Center | 44 | 57,542 | 67,083 | 103,062 | 85,818 |
| Nurse Clinician 2 | DHS | Southern Wisconsin Center | 50 | 81,206 | 66,150 | 77,212 | 65,463 |
| Resident Care Technician 2 | DHS | Mendota Mental Health Institute | 61 | 60,089 | 66,237 | 75,674 | 76,766 |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC | Oakhill Correctional Institution | 54 | 68,184 | 30,948 | 90,004 | 68,213 |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC | Columbia Correctional Institution | 53 | 45,611 | 68,342 | 55,612 | 57,906 |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC | Oakhill Correctional Institution | 44 | 46,332 | 68,325 | 53,321 | 65,989 |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC | Fox Lake Correctional Institution | 50 | 58,121 | 68,007 | 36,575 | 25,666 |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC | Oakhill Correctional Institution | 44 | 41,816 | 63,100 | 57,536 | 60,829 |
| Correctional Sergeant | DOC | Oakhill Correctional Institution | 45 | 44,526 | 56,641 | 59,042 | 42,614 |

Table 5
DOC's Premium Overtime Payments by Position Classification
(in millions)

| Position Classification | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | Percentage of Total |
|---|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------------|
| Correctional Officer ¹ | \$13.7 | \$16.0 | \$14.9 | \$14.3 | 42.8% |
| Correctional Sergeant ¹ | 10.5 | 12.7 | 12.1 | 11.5 | 34.4 |
| Probation and Parole Agent ² | 2.5 | 3.3 | 3.6 | 3.3 | 9.9 |
| Youth Counselor ² | 1.6 | 1.8 | 1.6 | 1.9 | 5.7 |
| Nursing Staff ² | 0.9 | 1.1 | 1.2 | 1.1 | 3.3 |
| Other | 1.1 | 1.2 | 1.3 | 1.3 | 3.9 |
| Total | \$30.3 | \$36.1 | \$34.7 | \$33.4 | 100.0% |

¹ The premium overtime in this table is less than the premium overtime reported in Table 3 because DHS also employs correctional officers and sergeants at some of its institutions.

² Includes related classifications.

Table 6
Premium Overtime Payments to Direct Patient Care Staff¹
(in millions)

| Department | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | Change from 2007 to 2008 |
|------------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|---------------|--------------------------|
| DHS | \$6.1 | \$7.4 | \$ 8.2 | \$ 8.7 | 6.1% |
| Veterans Affairs | 1.3 | 1.3 | 1.2 | 1.6 | 33.3 |
| DOC | 0.9 | 1.1 | 1.2 | 1.1 | (8.3) |
| Total | \$8.3 | \$9.8 | \$10.6 | \$11.4 | 7.5 |

¹ Includes seven nursing classifications, such as nurse clinician, resident care technician, psychiatric care technician, and nursing assistant.

■ ■ ■ ■

Appendix

Premium Overtime Payments by Agency
Calendar Years 2005 through 2008

| Department | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 |
|--|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| Administration | \$ 421,869 | \$ 504,549 | \$ 439,758 | \$ 462,106 |
| Agriculture, Trade and Consumer Protection | 179,306 | 124,282 | 199,750 | 169,558 |
| Arts Board | 82 | – | 377 | 222 |
| Board of Commissioners of Public Lands | – | 45 | 829 | 89 |
| Board on Aging and Long Term Care | 303 | 89 | 114 | 381 |
| Board for People with Developmental Disabilities | – | – | – | 443 |
| Children and Families | – | – | – | 2,002 |
| Commerce | 12,201 | 51,039 | 52,207 | 41,523 |
| Commissioner of Insurance | – | 95 | 612 | 862 |
| Corrections | 30,253,351 | 36,106,526 | 34,692,176 | 33,477,603 |
| Educational Communications Board | 88,328 | 104,373 | 78,648 | 79,882 |
| Government Accountability Board | 22,515 | 69,195 | 12,038 | 20,124 |
| Employee Trust Funds | 10,277 | 38,583 | 12,888 | 23,262 |
| Employment Relations Commission | – | – | – | 8 |
| Financial Institutions | 2,494 | 6,850 | 5,653 | 3,728 |
| Governor's Office | 624 | 776 | 883 | 536 |
| Health Services | 7,531,841 | 9,039,023 | 9,515,905 | 10,270,153 |
| Historical Society | 32,145 | 25,791 | 48,372 | 32,996 |
| Investment Board | 1,298 | 134 | 1,792 | – |
| Justice | 165,826 | 110,632 | 74,829 | 101,065 |
| Lieutenant Governor's Office | – | 1,041 | – | – |
| Military Affairs | 198,774 | 216,612 | 302,186 | 421,441 |
| Natural Resources | 1,634,058 | 1,831,990 | 1,875,133 | 2,067,713 |
| Office of State Employment Relations | 1,416 | 1,475 | 1,855 | 1,240 |
| Public Defender Board | 76,525 | 82,028 | 93,328 | 85,215 |
| Public Instruction | 163,167 | 241,716 | 237,794 | 211,575 |
| Public Service Commission | 158 | 333 | 271 | 41 |
| Regulation and Licensing | 2,207 | 1,775 | 8,394 | 10,112 |
| Revenue | 19,562 | 34,065 | 88,192 | 15,418 |
| Secretary of State | – | 411 | – | – |
| State Fair Park | 372,811 | 306,082 | 358,297 | 348,511 |
| State Treasurer | 2,816 | 789 | 3,689 | 3,043 |
| Tourism | 773 | 1,750 | 4,673 | 4,015 |
| Transportation | 3,502,094 | 3,489,676 | 3,415,273 | 3,563,576 |
| Veterans Affairs | 1,509,282 | 1,539,052 | 1,526,841 | 1,885,478 |
| Workforce Development | 648,697 | 872,799 | 748,720 | 978,613 |
| Total | \$46,854,800 | \$54,803,576 | \$53,801,477 | \$54,282,534 |